

THE PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION SYSTEM IN KORAPUT

A study of PDS implementation in 3 gram panchayats of Koraput district

December 2010

STUDY CONDUCTED AND SUPPORTED BY:



Society for Promoting Rural Education
and Development (SPREAD)

PO Box 12, New Jani Guda
Koraput, Orissa, Pin 764020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Introduction – About PDS.....	3
2. Supreme Court Orders on TPDS and AAY.....	4
Background	4
Relevant Orders	4
Antodaya Anna Yojana (AAY).....	6
3. TPDS in Odisha.....	8
TPDS Beneficiaries and Entitlement.....	8
Ration card holders in Odisha and in Koraput	8
Entitlement under PDS in Odisha.....	8
PDS Challenges in Odisha	8
Monitoring and Supervision Mechanism.....	8
Grievance Redressal Mechanism	9
4. Study Overview.....	10
Objectives	10
Study Area.....	10
Distribution of Respondents by Block.....	11
Methodology.....	11
Study Area PDS Information	11
Details of the PDS cards of 3 GPs.....	11
Monthly Quantity and Rate of the PDS items.....	12
Allotment, Lifting, and Requirements.....	13
5. Fair Price Shops.....	14
Types of Ownership	14
Role and Responsibility of Dealers.....	14
6. Survey Findings	16
Dealers in the Survey Area.....	16
Card Status in the Survey Area	16
Dealer Operation and Transparency.....	18
Annexures.....	19
Annexure 1: Allotment, Lifting, and Requirement.....	19
Annexure 2: Never Issued Cards	20
Annexure 3: Lost Cards	23
Annexure 4: Wrong Cards.....	25

1. INTRODUCTION - ABOUT PDS

The Public Distribution System (PDS) is one of the oldest food subsidy programmes in the country. It was introduced by the British government during the Second World War in 1939 to face food scarcity, maintain price stability and check dishonest practices in private trade. The basic framework for the PDS was firmed up in 1942.

Since then there have been many changes in the PDS. After reported hunger deaths in Orissa and Madhya Pradesh, the Revamped Public Distribution System (RPDS) was introduced in 1992 for the people of disadvantaged geographic locations such as hilly and tribal areas. Under RPDS, 1,752 blocks falling under the Desert Development Programme, Drought Prone Areas Programme, Integrated Tribal Development Projects and Designated Hill areas were supplied essential commodities like wheat, rice, sugar, edible oil, kerosene and soft coke. 143 blocks of Orissa were covered under this RPDS scheme. However, RPDS was widely criticized for its failure to serve the population Below the Poverty Line (BPL), limited coverage in the states with high concentration of rural poor and lack of transparent and accountable arrangements for delivery.

The Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS) was then introduced in June 1997. It aimed to identify the BPL families in every state and provide them with a certain quantity of food grains at specially subsidized prices. Food grains are also provided to families above the poverty line (APL), but the quantum of subsidy is lower as compared to that for the BPL families. Thus, there was a shift from PDS being a universal system to a targeted one where the population is divided into those above the poverty line (APL) and BPL. The prices at which grains are sold to these two groups differ and in most states the quantity of grain allocated is also different.

In order to make TPDS even more focused and targeted towards the poorest category of population, the "Antodaya Anna Yojana" (AAY) was launched in December 2000 for one crore of the poorest of the poor families. The scale of monthly rice issue that was initially 25 kg per family was increased to 35 kg per family per month with effect from 1 April 2002. The AAY scheme was expanded in three stages, each time by 50 lakh households, bringing the total number of beneficiaries to 2.5 crore households by May 2005, which is about 38% of the BPL households.

TPDS brings along with it issues related to setting a cap on the number of BPL households and identifying BPL households. There have been many problems documented with the estimation and the identification of poverty, with the overwhelming opinion now being that the current poverty line is too low and that the methodology for estimation is inappropriate resulting in a large number of exclusion and inclusion errors. To correct these problems the Government of India set up two committees (Tendulkar Committee and Saxena Committee) to review the methodology for estimation and identification respectively.

While this survey as well encountered many problems in the identification of the poor, where many poor families were left out of the BPL net and therefore out of the resulting benefits from the various schemes aimed at the BPL households, the objective of the survey did not primarily include assessing the identification issues. This survey was mainly concerned with assessing whether the benefits that are supposed to reach those who are already eligible are reaching them or not.

2. SUPREME COURT ORDERS ON TPDS AND AAY

Background

The Public Distribution System (PDS) is a means of distributing food grain and other basic commodities at subsidised prices through “fair price shops”. Every family is supposed to have a ration card. In 1997, the PDS became “targeted”: different ration cards were issued to households “Below the Poverty Line” (BPL) and those “Above the Poverty Line” (APL), and each category has different entitlements. Today, both BPL and APL households are entitled to 35 kg of grain per month, but the issue price is higher for APL households. In fact, it is so high that most APL households do not buy grain from the PDS. Thus, in practice the PDS is restricted to BPL households. Even in years when the APL prices correspond very closely with the market prices, the APL offtake has remained very low since State Governments are not lifting their APL quotas. The Government of India has now reduced the APL quotas for all States and restricted it to the average of the last three years of APL offtake for that particular State.

In 2001 Antodaya cards were introduced as a sub-category of BPL cards. However, the Supreme Court later stated that the Antodaya programme should not be restricted to those with a BPL card (see Section 2.3). Thus, Antodaya cards have become a separate card, distinct from either BPL or APL. Some households also have other cards, such as Annapurna cards (see Section 2.9).

The PDS is facing many obstacles including widespread leakages and corruption. The Supreme Court has taken notice of this and formed a Central Vigilance Committee on the Public Distribution System (CVC-PDS) in its order dated 12 July 2006. The CVC-PDS is chaired by Justice (Retd.) DP Wadhwa from the Commission of the Supreme Court, with Dr. N.C. Saxena as the Member-Convenor. The committee is presently looking into the problems that are affecting the proper functioning of PDS and exploring remedial measures.

Relevant Orders

Identification of BPL families

On 28 November 2001, the Supreme Court directed the state governments “to complete the identification of BPL families, issuing of cards and commencement of distribution of 25 kg grain per family per month latest by 1 January 2002.” Note that the entitlements of BPL families were subsequently raised from 25 kg of grain per month to 35 kg.

Orders relating to the “BPL list” are also relevant to PDS, since the BPL list is the basis on which BPL and APL ration cards are distributed. Note in particular that (1) the central and state governments have been directed to “frame clear guidelines for proper identification of BPL families” in consultation with the Supreme Court Commissioners; and (2) no-one is supposed to be removed from the BPL list until such time as the court deliberates this matter.

Accessibility of ration shops and regular supply of grain

On several occasions, the Supreme Court directed the government to ensure that all ration shops open regularly. For instance, one of the very first interim orders (dated 23 July 2001),

states: "We direct the states to see that all the PDS shops, if closed, are re-opened and start functioning within one week from today and regular supplies made." Similarly, an interim order dated 8 May 2002 states: "The respondents shall ensure that the ration shops remain open throughout the month, during fixed hours, the details of which will be displayed on the notice board."

Accountability of PDS dealers

The 8 May 2002 order also states that the licenses of PDS dealers and shopkeepers should be cancelled if they: "(a) do not keep their shops open throughout the month during the stipulated period; (b) fail to provide grain to BPL families strictly at BPL rates and no higher; (c) keep the cards of BPL households with them; (d) make false entries in the BPL cards; (e) engage in black-marketing or siphoning away of grains to the open market and hand over such ration shops to such other person/organizations." Further, "the concerned authorities/functionaries would not show any laxity on the subject."

Monitoring of the PDS

As mentioned earlier, a central vigilance committee (CVC-PDS) has been constituted to investigate the problems affecting the proper functioning of the public distribution system and suggest remedial measures. "For this purpose, the committee shall, amongst other things, focus on: (a) the mode of appointment of the dealers; (b) the ideal commission or the rates payable to the dealer; (c) modalities as to how the committees already in place, can function better; and (d) modes as to how there can be transparency in allotment of the food stock to be sold at the shops." Aside from this, the committee was asked to suggest a transparent mode of appointing PDS dealers and ways to make the existing vigilance committees more effective.

Permission to buy in instalments

Arrangements must be made to "permit the BPL household to buy the ration in instalments."

Awareness generation

"Wide publicity shall be given so as to make BPL families aware of their entitlement."

Comments

The Supreme Court orders on the PDS should be read together with the Central Government's "PDS (Control) Order" of August 2001. This order contains sweeping directions for holding FPS managers and others accountable and should itself be read in conjunction with the Essential Commodities Act. Taken together, these three sets of orders (Supreme Court orders, PDS Control Order, and Essential Commodities Act) can be used quite effectively to ensure that people get their due.

BPL targeting has attracted widespread criticism. There is much evidence that the "BPL list" is highly unreliable: well-off households often have a BPL card while poor households have an APL card, if they have a card at all. This is partly because the BPL survey used for identifying families below the poverty line is fundamentally flawed. This issue has been taken up in Supreme Court hearings from time to time.

Antodaya Anna Yojana (AAY)

Orders relating to Antodaya Anna Yojana (AAY) and Annapurna are also relevant to the Public Distribution System, since these schemes are implemented through the PDS.

The aim of this scheme, launched in 2000, is to provide special food-based assistance to destitute households. These households are given a special ration card (an "Antodaya card"), and are entitled to special grain quotas at highly subsidised prices. Today, Antodaya cardholders are entitled to 35 kg of grain per month at Rs. 2/- per kg for wheat and Rs. 3/- per kg for rice. Initially, the Antodaya scheme covered 1 crore families, but this was later expanded to 1.5 crore families and then 2 crore families. Currently, around 40% of all BPL families are included in the Antodaya category.

AAY Supreme Court Orders

Orders related to PDS also apply to AAY, since AAY is a component of the PDS. For instance, the order of 23 July 2001, directing state governments to ensure regular supply of grain to the ration shops applies to AAY also.

The state governments were requested to consider providing grain free of cost to those who are so poor that they are unable to lift their quota, even at the highly subsidised AAY prices. The central government "shall formulate the scheme to extend the benefits of the Antodaya Anna Yojana to the destitute section of the population."

On 2 May 2003, the Supreme Court declared that all households belonging to six "priority groups" would be entitled to Antodaya cards. More precisely, the Government of India was directed "to place on AAY category the following groups of persons:

- Aged, infirm, disabled, destitute men and women, pregnant and lactating women, destitute women;
- widows and other single women with no regular support;
- old persons (aged 60 or above) with no regular support and no assured means of subsistence;
- households with a disabled adult and assured means of subsistence;
- households where due to old age, lack of physical or mental fitness, social customs, need to care for a disabled, or other reasons, no adult member is available to engage in gainful employment outside the house;
- primitive tribes.

Possession of a BPL card is not necessary for inclusion in the AAY category. The central government was directed to issue guidelines to this effect.

In April 2004, the Court asked the central government to direct the state governments to "accelerate the issue of Antodaya cards especially to primitive tribes". Further, "the guidelines issued to state governments shall be implemented in letter and spirit".

In the order dated 17 October 2004, the state governments were directed to complete the identification of AAY families and the distribution of AAY cards "by the end of the year," and to begin the distribution of grain to AAY cardholders "immediately". Further, the AAY cardholders "should not be made to pay, directly or indirectly, any amount other than what they are liable to pay for the supply taken".

Comments

The most important order here is the order of May 2nd, 2003, whereby six “priority groups” are entitled to Antodaya cards as a matter of right. However, the government is yet to devise (and implement) an effective procedure to ensure that all households in these priority groups are identified and covered under AAY. In the case of (so-called) “primitive tribes”, the task is relatively easy, and in some states Antodaya cards have been distributed to most families in this group. The other groups, however, have no simple means of claiming an Antodaya card as a matter of right.

3. TPDS IN ODISHA

TPDS Beneficiaries and Entitlement

Ration card holders in Odisha and in Koraput

Type of Card	Number in Odisha	Number in Koraput
BPL	37,587	1,86,176
APL	36,053	77,242
AAY	12,645	64,305
Annapurna	648	2,108
Total	86,928	

Entitlement under PDS in Odisha

Type of Card	Commodity	Quota	Cost
BPL	Rice	25 kg	Rs. 2.00 per kg
	Sugar	2 kg	Rs. 3.50 per kg
	Kerosene	4 L	Rs. 12.50-14.50 per L
APL	Rice	as available	Rs. 9.30 per kg
	Wheat	10-15 kg	Rs. 7.00 per kg
	Kerosene	4 L	Rs. 12.50-14.50 per L
APL in KBK Districts	Rice	25 kg	Rs. 2.00 per kg
	Wheat	10-15 kg	Rs. 7.00 per kg
	Kerosene	4 L	Rs. 12.50-14.50 per L
AAY	Rice	35 kg	Rs. 2.00 per kg
	Sugar	2 kg	Rs. 3.50 per kg
	Kerosene	4 L	Rs. 12.50-14.50 per L
Annapurna	Rice	10 kg	Free of cost

PDS Challenges in Odisha

In Odisha, numerous challenges have presented themselves in recent years.

- Non-adherence to framed rules
- Rely on BPL survey which is faulty and age old
- Identification is not proper – exclusion and inclusion errors
- No transparency or accountability
- Absence of monitoring and vigilance
- Private dealers and storage agents / whole seller and sub-whole seller
- Entitlement below prescribed order

Monitoring and Supervision Mechanism

Three types of vigilance committees are constituted in the State of Odisha:

- District Level Advisory Committee
- Block Level Advisory Committee
- Retailer Level Advisory Committee

District Level Advisory Committee (DLAC)

Composition: District collector (chairperson), MPs or their representatives, MLAs or their representatives, 2 members of Zilla Parisad (1 woman), 2 chairpersons of Panchayat Samitis (1 woman), 2 representatives of voluntary consumer organizations or NGOs active in the field of consumer protection (1 woman), additional district magistrate, DRDA project director, district social welfare officer, FCI district manager, district level coordinator of oil companies, civil supplies officer

Functions: To monitor the over-all functioning of Public Distribution System in the district, ensuring quantity and quantity; to address complaints; to approve changes to AAY and Annapurna beneficiary lists; to monitor Block Level Advisory Committees

Meetings: The committee is required to meet at least once per quarter or more frequently as required.

Block Level Advisory Committee (BLAC)

Composition: MLA (chairperson), chairperson of the urban local body, MP or his/her representatives, Ward councillors, 2 sarpanches, 4 consumers (1 woman, 1 SC/ST), representative of voluntary consumer organisation, 2 representatives of women's SHGs

Functions: To monitor receipt of PDS stocks of ensure their proper distribution; to make recommendations for appointment of retailers; to detect and prevent malpractice

Meetings: The committee should ordinarily meet monthly.

Retail Level Advisory Committee (RLAC)

Composition: Sarpanch of the concerned GP (chairperson), all ward members in whose wards the shops are situated, 4 literate consumers from the area of operation (1 woman, 1 SC/ST), representative of a women's SHG, representative of a voluntary consumer organization or NGO active in the field of consumer protection, executive officer of the GP

Functions: To ensure that the retailers lift the quantity allotted and do not divert any stock; to verify the ration card registers regularly and report fake/ghost /counterfeited cards; to monitor the quantity and quality of the PDS items; to verify the use of certified weights and measures

Meetings: RLAC is required to meet at least once a month.

Grievance Redressal Mechanism

The district collector and the DLAC are responsible for addressing complaints. All complaints are to be recorded and addressed within seven days. Complaints are collected primarily through a toll-free number (1-800-34567-607).

4. STUDY OVERVIEW

SPREAD has been working in Nandapur and Boipariguda blocks for many years. Experience working with the villagers there revealed inefficiencies in the functioning of the public distribution system (PDS). The problems were known qualitatively, but not quantitatively. Thus, it was decided that a survey would be undertaken to adequately measure the extent of the problems facing the villagers, with the goal of presenting the results at a public hearing.

Objectives

The interface with villagers of three GPs of Nandapur block was undertaken with the following objectives:

- Increase awareness of tribals' right to food through the PDS program.
- Rectify problems with ration cards, such as lost cards, ghost cards, duplicate cards, etc.
- Address issues of inefficiency and non-adherence to rules on the part of dealers and administration.
- Highlight problems faced by the beneficiaries in the distribution and price of PDS items.

Study Area

Three adjacent GPs of Nandapur block were included in the study. These GPs were chosen because the PDS in many of their villages was known to be dysfunctional.

Map of Koraput District



It was determined that every household would be surveyed, to adequately determine areas of corruption or neglect. A total of 5,557 households were included in the study.

Distribution of Respondents by Block

Name of the GP	Villages	Households
Panthlung	32	2,037
Golur	26	1,482
Kularsingh	36	2,038
Total	94	5,557

Methodology

Through the Right to Information Act, a request was made. The information received included the following:

- Number and names of ration card holders in the three GPs
- Allotment of PDS commodities to the GPs
- Lifting of PDS commodities from the fair price shops
- List of fair price shops

Village-level awareness was raised through leaflet distribution and informal meetings. Also, a community monitoring mechanism was introduced in many villages, consisting of a publicly displayed chart to track each family's receipt of PDS items.

The information gained from the RTI request was analysed by the team during a 3-day session, during which the team also learned more about the PDS scheme.

The survey team, comprising 30 SPREAD staff members, conducted the main portion of the study from 13 November to 8 December 2010. Information from each household was collected and then matched against the information on file, gained from the RTI request. The following information was checked:

- Possession of appropriate ration card (i.e. BPL, APL, AAY, Annapurna)
- Lifting of PDS quota from June to November 2010
- Quality and price of PDS quota

Focus groups were held in each village to discuss the following information;

- Fair price shop details – distance, timing/dates of operation, transparency, behaviour toward beneficiaries, complaint box
- Number/names of families without cards
- Price and availability of PDS items
- Status of vigilance committees

Study Area PDS Information

Details of the PDS cards of 3 GPs

Name of the GP	Type of card						Total
	APL	BPL	AAY	AP	None	None %	
Panthlung	31	1,020	323	1	623	31.18	1,998
Golur	79	741	242	0	419	28.29	1,481
Kularsingh	30	1,287	241	1	506	24.50	2,065
Total	140	3,048	806	2	1,548		

Monthly Quantity and Rate of the PDS items

Card Type	Item	Government Norms		Beneficiaries' Estimate		Difference	
		Quantity	Rate per unit	Quantity	Rate per unit	Quantity	Rate per unit
BPL	Rice	25 kg	Rs. 2	23 kg	Rs. 2	2 kg	Rs. 0
	Sugar	2 kg	Rs. 13.50	1 kg	Rs.15	1 kg	Rs. 1.5
	Kerosene	4 L	Rs. 12.50-14.50	1-2 L	Rs. 15	2-3 L	Rs 0.5-2.5
APL	Rice	25 kg	Rs. 2	23 kg	Rs. 2	2 kg	Rs. 0
	Kerosene	4 L	Rs. 12.50-14.50	1-2 L	Rs. 15	2-3 L	Rs 0.5-2.5
	Wheat	10 kg	Rs. 7	0	-	10 kg	-
AAY	Rice	35 kg	Rs. 2	33 kg	Rs. 2	2 kg	Rs. 0
	Sugar	2 kg	Rs. 13.50	1 kg	Rs.15	1 kg	Rs. 1.5
	Kerosene	4 L	Rs. 12.50-14.50	1-2 L	Rs. 15	2-3 L	Rs 0.5-2.5
AP	Rice	10 kg	Free	10 kg	Free	0 kg	Rs. 0

Data in the above table is based on focus group discussion conducted in each village.

Rice

The beneficiaries are paying the correct price for the rice (Rs. 2 per kg), but they are receiving slightly less than their quota. They are usually given one bag of rice for two card holders. Since the "50 kg" bags actually weigh 45-46 kg, each card holder receives up to 2.5 kg less than his/her quota.

Sugar

Sugar equal to 2 kg per beneficiary per month has been allotted, according to the RTI data provided. However, the card holders have only lifted 6 kg each, on average, during the six months covered by the survey (June to November 2010). Further, the card holders are paying Rs. 15 per kg instead of the stipulated rate of Rs. 13.50 per kg.

Kerosene

The beneficiaries bought only 1-2 L kerosene each month at Rs. 15 per L, which is less than have of their quota and for a higher price.

Wheat

Government norms stipulate that APL card holders can purchase 10 kg wheat per month at a rate of Rs. 7 per kg, but none of the 140 APL card holders from the 3 GPs have ever received any wheat.

Allotment, Lifting, and Requirements

Name of the GP	Items	Allotment(in qtls/Litres)	Lifting(in qtls/Litres)	Requirements (in qtls/Litres)
Panthlung	Rice	377.25	375.15	375.90
	Sugar	23.14	23.14	26.86
	Kerosene	4,400	--	5,496
	Wheat	0	0	3.10
Golur	Rice	311.45	306.45	289.70
	Sugar	18.86	18.86	19.66
	Kerosene	4,000	--	4,248
	Wheat	0	0	7.90
Kularsingh	Rice	421.45	417.45	413.70
	Sugar	25.62	25.62	30.56
	Kerosene	6,000	--	6,232
	Wheat	0	0	3.00

A more detailed presentation of the allotment, lifting, and requirement details can be found in Annexure 1.

- The requirement of kerosene in all 3 GPs is greater than the actual allotment. In Panthlung GP, the required amount of kerosene is 24.91% greater than the amount allotted; in Golur GP, the required amount is 6.20% greater; in Kularsingh GP, the required amount is 3.87% greater.
- The requirement of sugar in all 3 GPs is higher than the allotted/lifted amount. In Panthlung GP, the required amount of sugar is 16.08% greater than the amount allotted; in Golur GP, the required amount is 4.24% greater; in Kularsingh GP, the required amount is 19.28% greater.
- The fair price shops aren't allotted any wheat, even though there are APL cardholders in each of the 3 GPs, entitled to 10 kg wheat per month.

5. FAIR PRICE SHOPS

Types of Ownership

- GPs
- Self-help groups
- Cooperative societies
- Individual private dealers
- Directly by the Orissa State Civil Supplies Corporation (mobile shops)

The Government of Odisha provided Rs. 25,000 for seed money to each GP for smooth functioning of the FPS.

In Koraput, district, there are 22 storage agents distributing to 1,482 fair price shops. 485 of these shops are privately owned, 816 are SHG-owned, 18 are owned by a cooperative, and 163 are GP-managed.

Role and Responsibility of Dealers

According to the 2001 PDS Control Order issued by the Supreme Court, the responsibilities and duties of fair price shop owners include the following:

- sale of essential commodities as per the entitlement of ration card holders at the retail issue prices fixed by the concerned State Government under the Public Distribution System;
- display of information on a notice at a prominent place in the shop on daily basis regarding:
 - list of BPL and Antodaya beneficiaries
 - entitlement of essential commodities
 - scale of issue
 - retail issue prices
 - timings of opening and closing of the fair price shop
 - stock of essential commodities received during the month
 - opening and closing stock of essential commodities and
 - the authority for redressal of grievances/lodging complaints with respect to quality and quantity of essential commodities under the Public Distribution System;
- maintenance of records of ration card holders (APL, BPL and Antodaya), stock register, issue or sale register;
- furnishing copies of specified documents, namely, ration card register, stock register, sale register to the office of the Gram Panchayat or Nagar Palika or Vigilance Committee or any other body authorized by State Governments for the purpose;
- display of samples of foodgrains being supplied through the fair price shop;
- production of books and records relating to the allotment and distribution of essential commodities to the inspecting agency and furnishing of such information as may be called for by the designated authority;
- account of the actual distribution of essential commodities and the balance stock at the end of the month to the designated authority of the concerned State Government with a copy to the Gram Panchayat;
- opening and closing of the fair price shop as per the prescribed timings displayed on the notice board.

6. SURVEY FINDINGS

Dealers in the Survey Area

Name of the GP	Name of Dealer/ Retailer	Location of FPS	Items distributed
Golur	PEO	Golur Hatapada	Rice, Sugar, Kerosene
	Indira Gandhi SHG	Majhiguda	Kerosene
Panthlung	PEO, Panthlung	Hatguda	Rice, Sugar, Kerosene
	Jyoti SHG	Andarguda	Rice, Sugar, Kerosene
	Bhudevi SHG	Andarguda	Kerosene
	Jhankardevi SHG	Pujariput	Kerosene
Kularsingh	PEO	Kularsing	Rice, Sugar
	Trinath SHG	Abroda	Rice, Sugar, Kerosene
	Rantamauli SHG	Ranta	Kerosene
	Trinath SHG	Budding	Kerosene

Card Status in the Survey Area

Names on 1997 BPL List but Never Issued Cards

- Some village families are in the 1997 BPL list, but have never been provided with ration cards. Consequently, they have been deprived of PDS since 1997.
 - 65 beneficiaries in 19 villages of Panthlung GP
 - 8 beneficiaries in 5 villages of Golur GP
 - 4 beneficiaries in 3 villages of Kularsingh GP
- A list of the deprived beneficiaries' names can be found in Annexure 1.

Lost cards

- Some village families lost their ration cards. Requests for replacement have gone unfulfilled.
 - 13 beneficiaries in 7 villages of Panthlung GP
 - 10 beneficiaries in 5 villages of Golur GP
 - 9 beneficiaries in 6 villages of Kularsingh GP
- A list of the beneficiaries with lost cards can be found in Annexure 2.

Deprived beneficiaries

- Many families are visibly poor, but were never included in any BPL list.
 - 616 beneficiaries in 31 villages of Panthlung GP
 - 413 beneficiaries in 25 villages of Golur GP
 - 507 beneficiaries in 33 villages of Kularsingh GP
- A list of these beneficiaries can be found in Annexure 3.

Manipulation in card distribution

- 5 beneficiaries in 6 villages of Kularsingh GP are listed in the BPL category, but have been provided with APL cards. Similarly, 5 beneficiaries of Kularsingh GP are listed in

the Antodaya category, but have been provided with APL cards; 23 beneficiaries in 10 villages of Kularsingh GP are listed in the Antodaya category, but have been provided with BPL cards.

- A list of the affected beneficiaries' names can be found in Annexure 4.

Beneficiaries deprived of getting PDS rice

- 63 beneficiaries in 7 villages of Kularsingh GP did not receive their quota of PDS rice. 21 of the 63 beneficiaries did not receive their quota for the month of May 2010; 42 of them did not receive their quota for May, June, September or October.

Irregularities in distribution

- 69 beneficiaries (BPL-55, AAY-14) in Rasaput village of Kularsingh GP have never gotten sugar.

Cards snatched away by the dealers

- 2 beneficiaries in 2 villages of Golur GP had BPL cards, but at their death, the cards were confiscated by the FPS owner instead of being transferred to their family members or given to the appropriate authorities.
 - Late Saru Khora, h/o Tulasa Khora, Padalput village, BPL no. 5495
 - Late Gabardhan Pangi, s/o Dhabulu, Dimidi village, BPL no. 5476

Actual Antodaya beneficiaries deprived of getting cards

- The following deserving beneficiaries of Kularsingh GP have not been considered for Antodaya cards.
 - Moti Anukum (widow), w/o Kartik, age 35, Kumbhiguda village
 - Moti Burudi (widow/aged destitute), w/o Gopinath, age 75, Kumbhiguda village
 - Sundaram Khora (widow/PWD/aged destitute), w/o Late Dhana, age 75, Kumbhiguda village
 - Gopana Kamidi (agricultural labourer), s/o Dev, Kanta village

Ambiguity in card allotment

- There is ambiguity in card allotment in Aborda village of Kularsingh GP.
 - BPL no. 11099 belongs to 1) Arjuna Gagod, s/o Madhu and 2) Nila Kirsani
 - BPL no. 11325 belongs to 1) Buduka Kirsani, w/o Soma and 2) Budei Kirsani, w/o Late Guru

Ghost card

- Linka Tangi, s/o Kubana, Bankaput village, Kularsingh gram panchayat, BPL no. 15645, left the village 10 years ago. Linka's card has never been shifted to another beneficiary or seized, but the dealer still lifts Linka's quota.

Dealer Operation and Transparency

To assess the status of the fair price shops serving the 3 GPs, a focus group discussion was facilitated in each village. The following general observations were made:

- In 3 Panchayats (Golur, Kularsingh, Panthlung) the distribution of PDS is not taken place in stipulated date as per norm. The fair price shops of 3 panchayat open 2 to 3 days in a month.
- The dealers distribute the PDS item as per their own convenience.
- As per the convenience and access of the beneficiaries there is inadequate lifting points in 3 panchayats.
- The fair price shops open from 10 A.M to 5 P.M in 3 panchayats when PDS is distributed among the beneficiaries.
- There is no transparency board related to PDS in 3 panchayats.
- There is non-availability of complaint box in the PDS centre and grievance redressal mechanism.
- There is not any system of distribution of PDS item on instalment basis.
- There should be a retailer level vigilance committee to check and control corruption in every panchayat. But as per the statement of beneficiaries and dealer they are unaware about retailer level vigilance committee.

ANNEXURES

Annexure 1: Allotment, Lifting, and Requirement

SL	GP	Item	Card Type	No. of Beneficiaries	Req. (qtl or L)	Total Req.	Allot. (qtl or L)	Total Allot.	Lifting (qtl or L)						Total Lift.
									Mar 2010	Apr 2010	May 2010	Jun 2010	Jul 2010	Aug 2010	
1	Golur	Rice	BPL	741	185.25	289.70	196.75	311.45	192.75	192.75	192.75	192.75	192.75	192.75	1844.7
2	Golur	Rice	APL	79	19.75		13.00		13	13	13	13	13	13	
3	Golur	Rice	AAAY	242	84.70		100.80		101.1	101.1	101.1	101.1	101.1	101.1	
4	Golur	Rice	Annapurna	0	0.00		0.90		0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	
5	Golur	Sugar	BPL	741	14.82	19.66	18.86	18.86	0	21	18.86	38.97	15	0	93.83
6	Golur	Sugar	AAAY	242	4.84										
7	Golur	Kerosene	BPL	741	2,964	4,248	4,000	4,000							
8	Golur	Kerosene	APL	79	316										
9	Golur	Kerosene	AAAY	242	968										
10	Panthlung	Rice	BPL	1,020	255.00	375.90	245.75	376.35	244	244	244	244	244	244	2245.5
11	Panthlung	Rice	APL	31	7.75		6.25		6.25	6.25	6.25	6.25	6.25	6.25	
12	Panthlung	Rice	AAAY	323	113.05		124.25		123.9	123.9	123.9	123.9	123.9	123.9	
13	Panthlung	Rice	Annapurna	1	0.10		0.10		0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	
14	Panthlung	Sugar	BPL	1,020	20.40	26.86	23.14	23.14	0	0	23.14	47.83	36.38	9	116.35
15	Panthlung	Sugar	AAAY	323	6.46										
16	Panthlung	Kerosene	BPL	1,020	4,080	5,496	4,400	4,400							
17	Panthlung	Kerosene	APL	31	124										
18	Panthlung	Kerosene	AAAY	323	1,292										
19	Kularsingh	Rice	BPL	1,287	321.75	413.70	273.00	421.45	270	270	270	270	270	279	2514.6
20	Kularsingh	Rice	APL	30	7.50		10.25		10.25	10.25	10.25	10.25	10.25	10.25	
21	Kularsingh	Rice	AAAY	241	84.35		137.20		136.5	136.5	136.5	136.5	136.5	136.5	

SL	GP	Item	Card Type	No. of Beneficiaries	Req. (qtl or L)	Total Req.	Allot. (qtl or L)	Total Allot.	Lifting (qtl or L)						Total Lift.
									Mar 2010	Apr 2010	May 2010	Jun 2010	Jul 2010	Aug 2010	
22	Kularsingh	Rice	Annapurna	1	0.10		1.00		0.8	0.8	0.8	0.9	0.9	0.9	
23	Kularsingh	Sugar	BPL	1,287	25.74	30.56	25.62	25.62	13	21.5	25.62	52.96	50.25	0	163.33
24	Kularsingh	Sugar	AAV	241	4.82										
25	Kularsingh	Kerosene	BPL	1,287	5,148										
26	Kularsingh	Kerosene	APL	30	120	6,232	6,000	6,000							
27	Kularsingh	Kerosene	AAV	241	964										

Annexure 2: Never Issued Cards

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Card type	Card number
1	Golur	Podeising	Padma Nayak	Late- Ghasi	BPL	5138
2	Golur	Bailiguda	Gangadhar Burudi	Laxmidhar	BPL	5704
3	Golur	Golur	China Melka	Rauto	BPL	4987
4	Golur	Khuda	Mangala Khilo	Ghasi	AAV	5155
5	Golur	Khuda	Budu Pangi	Chitra	AAV	5158
6	Golur	Khuda	Kanka Lamdia	Bhagban	BPL	5119
7	Golur	Khuda	Gouri Guntha	Budu	BPL	5123
8	Golur	Tamding	Sitaram Khora	Guru	BPL	5230
9	Panthlung	Jarai	Urdhab Alang	Sanyasi	AAV	16357
10	Panthlung	Jarai	Salu Alang	Bhimana	BPL	16365
11	Panthlung	Jarai	Balu Khoda	Kamulu	BPL	16380
12	Panthlung	Jarai	Dhabulu Khora	Sukra	BPL	16301

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Card type	Card number
13	Panthlung	Jarai	Mani Khora	Sinaya	BPL	16374
14	Panthlung	Jarai	Ram acahndra Khora	Biswanath	BPL	16356
15	Panthlung	Sandel	Bada Pangi	Damu	BPL	15639
16	Panthlung	Sandel	Rama Tangul	Hari	BPL	15608
17	Panthlung	Godiput	LLaxman Hantal	Ghasi	AAAY	15919
18	Panthlung	Mariput	Sanadei Tangul	Brajo	BPL	15755
19	Panthlung	Hataguda	Jayaram Khemundu	Damu	AAAY	15593
20	Panthlung	Anagrai	Sanyasi Alang	Samana	BPL	16355
21	Panthlung	Anagrai	Urdhav Alang	Sanyasi	AAAY	16357
22	Panthlung	Anagrai	Ram Chandra Khora	Viswanath	BPL	16356
23	Panthlung	Anagrai	Balu Khoda	Kamulu	BPL	16283
24	Panthlung	Anagrai	Dhabulu Khora	Sukra	BPL	16301
25	Panthlung	Anagrai	Mani Khora	Sinaya	BPL	16374
26	Panthlung	Katua	Dasrath Jara	Urdhav	AAAY	15647
27	Panthlung	Katua	Laban Rasai	Lingaraj	BPL	15676
28	Panthlung	Katua	Lachmu Jari	Dasarath	BPL	15705
29	Panthlung	Sitalput	Damadhar Khemundu	Budra	BPL	15499
30	Panthlung	Alangul	Laxmi Dhar Khilo	Chandal	BPL	15845
31	Panthlung	Alangul	Damadar Khemundu	Sukta	BPL	16024
32	Panthlung	Pangiput	Raghunath Duru	Debo	BPL	15499
33	Panthlung	Pamulput	Sahadev Pangi	Dambu	BPL	15803
34	Panthlung	Panasput	Bhikun Pangi	Dhabulu	AAAY	15253
35	Panthlung	Panasput	Subarao Hantal	Ramarao	BPL	15181
36	Panthlung	Sudub	Damu Khilo	Puyu	BPL	15214
37	Panthlung	Sudub	Libri Sindari	Basu	BPL	15195

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Card type	Card number
38	Panthlung	Sudub	Sitaram Khilo	Badi	BPL	15236
39	Panthlung	Sudub	Subarao Sindheri	Budra	BPL	15226
40	Panthlung	Sudub	Anketrao Khora	Gangudu	BPL	15329
41	Panthlung	Tankel	Ramarao Gunjia	Jaganath	BPL	16351
42	Panthlung	Tankel	Sanu Munderi	Ghasi	BPL	16354
43	Panthlung	Tankel	Kandaya Onjel	Ganthana	AAAY	16360
44	Panthlung	Tankel	Damu Golori	Dhana	AAAY	16362
45	Panthlung	Tankel	Lingana Bonda	Enkana	AAAY	16378
46	Panthlung	Tankel	Harischandra Khuda	Bajaya	BPL	16382
47	Panthlung	Ratulput	Budu Patia	Balaram	BPL	16296
48	Panthlung	Ratulput	Cherenga Khora	Adu	BPL	16364
49	Panthlung	Gunthaput	Phursati Guntha		BPL	15724
50	Panthlung	Andarguda	Gampha Satyama	Late-Kesab	BPL	15190
51	Panthlung	Andarguda	Arjuna Patia		BPL	15387
52	Panthlung	Andarguda	Manga Bhimana	Parvati	BPL	15156
53	Panthlung	Andarguda	Gampha Laxman	Ranama	BPL	15337
54	Panthlung	Andarguda	Jambel Lombana		BPL	15229
55	Panthlung	Andarguda	Radhama Sobha	Sethi	BPL	15346
56	Panthlung	Andarguda	Satyam Sobha	Narayan	BPL	16018
57	Panthlung	Andarguda	Lingana Sobha	Ujana	BPL	16033
58	Panthlung	Andarguda	Phursati Pradhan	Lalit	BPL	16040
59	Panthlung	Andarguda	Bhimana Pradhani	Gopinath	BPL	16047
60	Panthlung	Andarguda	Basudeb Guntha	Arjuna	BPL	15363
61	Panthlung	Andarguda	Bhimana Hantal	Sonu	AAAY	15180
62	Panthlung	Andarguda	Hari Urgai	Bhagban	BPL	15308

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Card type	Card number
63	Panthlung	Andarguda	Jagama Khoda	Sonu	BPL	15298
64	Panthlung	Andarguda	Lachaman Srigam	Dharmana	BPL	15257
65	Panthlung	Andarguda	Satrughan Puajri	Gunthana	BPL	15168
66	Panthlung	Andarguda	Sudarsan Dash	Srinibas	BPL	15255
67	Panthlung	Andarguda	Babaya Pradhani	Ramarao	BPL	15191
68	Panthlung	Tumbakota	Dhano Burudi	Mangala	BPL	16439
69	Panthlung	Tumbakota	Lachu Limkia	Samara	BPL	16453
70	Panthlung	Tumbakota	Madhu Sudan Khemundu	Vidika	BPL	16465
71	Panthlung	Tumbakota	Biswanath Khemundu	Guru	BPL	16473
72	Panthlung	Tumbakota	Raghunath Hantal	Gundu	AAV	16474
73	Panthlung	Pradhaniput	Sahdeb Pangi	Mulia	AAV	16224
74	Kularsingh	Doraguda	Chandra Khora	Late- Dhana	BPL	12027
75	Kularsingh	Rasaput	Ramulu Kamdi	Janu	APL	26455
76	Kularsingh	Kularsing	Upendra Talmari	Laxman	BPL	11651
77	Kularsingh	Kularsing	Applaamma Khilo	Enkana	BPL	1497

Annexure 3: Lost Cards

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Card type	Card number	Remarks
1	Golur	Dimdikhudbu	Gabardhan Pangi	Dhabulu	BPL	5476	The card lies with the dealer
2	Golur	Dumriguda	Aru Hantal	Sineya	BPL	5042	The dealer has not returned the card since last 1 year
3	Golur	Dumriguda	Biju Khilo		BPL	4938	The dealer has not returned the card since last 1 year
4	Golur	Dumriguda	Mangala Khara	Kamulu	BPL	4731	Since last 1 year

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Card type	Card number	Remarks
5	Golur	Gangaguda	Rammurti Khora	Halan	BPL	4812	The card lies with the Sarpanch
6	Golur	Padalput	Saru Khora	w/o Tulasa Khora	BPL	5495	
7	Golur	Tamding	Das Hantal	Kesu	AAY	5195	The dealer has not returned the card since last 1 year
8	Golur	Tamding	Madan Pujari	Ghasi	APL	25911	The card lies with dealer
9	Golur	Tamding	Mangudu Pangi	Sona	APL	25905	The card lies with dealer
10	Golur	Tamding	Ratu Sindheri	Mulia	BPL	5224	He has lost his card during lifting of PDS item
11	Kularsingh	Enningguda	Moti Khilo	Ramdas	BPL		Since last 1 year
12	Kularsingh	Gandisikarput	Guru Khora	Narsingha	BPL	26457	Since last 4 year
13	Kularsingh	Kumbharput	Parsuram Kirsani	Dhana	BPL	11635	Lost his six months ago
14	Kularsingh	Maripalam	Bhaktaram Kindang	Guru	BPL	11270	Since August-2010
15	Kularsingh	Maripalam	Damdar Kindang	Guru	AAY	11123	Since August-2010
16	Kularsingh	Maripalam	Lachma Burudi	Sunadhar	BPL	11287	Since August-2010
17	Kularsingh	Padei	Jalendra Gurudi	Sukra	AAY	11203	Since October-2010
18	Kularsingh	Rasaput	Harajana Khora	Suti	AAY	12144	Since last 1 year
19	Kularsingh	Rasaput	Raju Kamudi	Laichan	BPL	12129	Since August-2010
20	Panthlung	Gutur	Moti Hantal	Labakusa	AAY	15596	Since last 3 years
21	Panthlung	Jarai	Arjuna Khoda	Hari	BPL	16359	Since October-2010
22	Panthlung	Jarai	Ghasi Ram Khora	Bhimsen	BPL	16272	Since October-2010
23	Panthlung	Pamulput	Arjuna Pampha	Damu	AAY	15784	Since last 5 years
24	Panthlung	Pamulput	Dalapati Khora	Chandra	BPL	15801	Lie with the dealer Since last 5 years
25	Panthlung	Pamulput	Lachu Khora	Biswanath	BPL	15781	Since last 5 years
26	Panthlung	Panasput	Bandhu Pangi	Sanyasi	BPL	15242	Lie with the dealer

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Card type	Card number	Remarks
27	Panthlung	Pujariput	Dasrath Pujari	Andu	BPL	15279	He lost his card during lifting of PDS item at shop point
28	Panthlung	Pujariput	Prahlad Pujari	Lalita	BPL	15265	He lost his card during lifting of PDS item at shop point
29	Panthlung	Sariapali	Mari Lacha	Sankada	BPL	15174	
30	Panthlung	Sariapali	Puyu Khora	Guru	BPL	15204	Lie with the dealer
31	Panthlung	Sidiput	Ram Chandra Kinchai	Ghasi	BPL	15893	The dealer has not returned the card
32	Panthlung	Sidiput	Sundar Rai Tungal	Sitaram	BPL	15996	

Annexure 4: Wrong Cards

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Proper Card Type	Current Card type	Length of Current Card	Card Number
1	Kularsingh	Nimalgandhi	Magana Khemundu	Indra	BPL	APL	1 year	BPL 26453
2	Kularsingh	Rasaput	Ramulu Khamidi	Jano	BPL	APL	1 year	BPL 26455
3	Kularsingh	Budding	Sanka Bhurudi	Narayan	AAY	APL	8 months	AAY 26458
4	Kularsingh	Enningguda	Sunadhar Golori	Ragu	BPL	APL	1 year	BPL 26482
5	Kularsingh	Enningguda	Gopi Khilo	Arjun	BPL	APL	1 year	BPL 26473
6	Kularsingh	Enningguda	Anu Guntha	Sukra	BPL	APL	1 year	BPL 26463
7	Kularsingh	Gamilput	Damburu Dora	Jagubandhu	AAY	APL	1 year	AAY 370015
8	Kularsingh	Kanta	Govinda Pangi	Magana	AAY	APL	1 year	AAY 26472
9	Kularsingh	Kanta	Kailash Chandra Patnaik	Ramesh	AAY	APL	1 year	AAY 26471
10	Kularsingh	Kanta	Kumari Khora	Kamesh	AAY	APL	1 year	AAY 26470
11	Kularsingh	Abarda	Dhoba Palmal	Kanthama	AAY	BPL		BPL 10983
12	Kularsingh	Abarda	Subha Odiya	Gabardhan	AAY	BPL		BPL 11113

SL	GP	Village	Name	Name of father/ husband	Proper Card Type	Current Card type	Length of Current Card	Card Number
13	Kularsingh	Abarda	Dasaratha Sisa	Damburu	AAY	BPL		BPL 11199
14	Kularsingh	Abarda	Bajaya Barik	Madhu	AAY	BPL		BPL 11218
15	Kularsingh	Abarda	Suku Kirsani	Budu	AAY	BPL		BPL 11004
16	Kularsingh	Abarda	Apala Raju Barik	Raju	AAY	BPL		BPL 11303
17	Kularsingh	Khadaput	Banamali Banda	Taoda	AAY	BPL		BPL 11531
18	Kularsingh	Khadaput	Pati Pujari	Bhagaban	AAY	BPL		BPL 26448
19	Kularsingh	Doraguda	Dukhu Golori	Mangala	AAY	BPL		BPL 12025
20	Kularsingh	Budding	Narsingh Khilo	Ram	AAY	BPL		BPL 11349
21	Kularsingh	Gandhisikarput	Krishna Kamudi	Hirana	AAY	BPL		BPL 11506
22	Kularsingh	Badela	Chandma Dora	Jagatrai	AAY	BPL		BPL 11019
23	Kularsingh	Lamphi	Pandu Kutradi	Pati	AAY	BPL		BPL 11753
24	Kularsingh	Enningguda	Sahadev Khilo	Ghasi	AAY	BPL		BPL 11445
25	Kularsingh	Kularsingh	Ghasiram Pangi	Budu	AAY	BPL		BPL 11605
26	Kularsingh	Kularsingh	Malati Khilo	Lalit	AAY	BPL		BPL 11578
27	Kularsingh	Kanta	Bati Khora	Natho	AAY	BPL		BPL 11814
28	Kularsingh	Kanta	Kamulu Lachan Pujari	Bhikari	AAY	BPL		BPL 11876
29	Kularsingh	Kanta	Mati Hantal	Dhana	AAY	BPL		BPL 11870
30	Kularsingh	Kanta	Sanyasi Pujari	Ghasi	AAY	BPL		BPL 11982
31	Kularsingh	Kanta	Hiramoni Jarsingh	Jaya	AAY	BPL		BPL 11976
32	Kularsingh	Kanta	Purna Chandra Sethi	Ghasanta	AAY	BPL		BPL 11939
33	Kularsingh	Kanta	Gopi Matam	Ghasi	AAY	BPL		BPL 11893